

OFFERED BY COUNCILOR ERIN J. MURPHY



CITY OF BOSTON IN CITY COUNCIL

ORDER FOR A HEARING TO ADDRESS THE CONSTITUTIONAL AND OPEN MEETING LAW VIOLATIONS OF THE REDISTRICTING COMMITTEE

WHEREAS, On Wednesday, March 29, 2023, 5,816 pages of redistricting correspondence between all thirteen Councilors and Wayne Yeh, Policy Director for Councilor Liz Breadon, were obtained by Attorney John Lyons per his FOIA request; *and*

WHEREAS, I am requesting that all Council members receive a copy of the documents obtained through this Freedom of Information Act (FOIA); *and*

WHEREAS, On September 26, 2022 the President of the NAACP invited eight City Councilors, including the Chair and Vice Chair of the Redistricting Committee, to a community meeting at Lena Park Development Corporation to discuss and share proposed redistricting maps. The attached excerpts from the email chain confirms that councilors attended, and shared out redistricting documents, with the community before the Chair properly presented these documents to the Redistricting Committee. Not all councilors were invited or aware of this meeting; *and*

In order to prepare, and be informed, we've scheduled and we're inviting you to a meeting on tomorrow, Tuesday, September 27, 6:00 PM-8:00 PM at Lena Park Community Development Corp.

President Sullivan has invited the 6 City Councilors who represent Roxbury, Dorchester, Mattapan, Hyde Park as well as the Redistricting Committee Co-Chairs. They will be given a slotted time to present on both the guiding principles and their thoughts on what the map should look like. You should know that there are at least 3 maps circulating now. We'll hear the thinking from the sponsoring Councilors and get to ask questions. We're anticipating a total of about forty attendees.

Here is a link to the map that was shown last night by Councilors Liz Breadon & Broan Worrell. I found this link within the "toolkit" they sent out.

WHEREAS, On Friday, October 7, 2022, Wayne Yeh sent an email stating that Councilor Breadon had asked him to reach out to run some analysis of maps that have been submitted. Wayne writes in this email that... "Our top objective was to create a 4th minority opportunity district in District 3 of at least 60% minority by voting

age population.” He goes on to write that... “We decided to go BOLD and are receiving fierce opposition as expected; *and*

WHEREAS, The Council was advised by several redistricting experts that we should not be chasing race percentages or we would be getting ourselves into legal trouble. District 3 is already an Opportunity District with a minority majority population but several councilors, and their staff, have made it their top objective to ignore legal advice and push to draw district lines based on race ; *and*

WHEREAS, There is a constitutional offense in drawing district lines based on race and the racial line-drawing itself causes the constitutional harm because it “stigmatizes persons by reason of their membership in a racial group and incites racial hostility.” Shaw vs Reno, 509 U.S. 630 (1993); *and*

WHEREAS, Redistricting has to be race conscious to ensure that district maps do not unfairly dilute minority voting strength in violation of the VRA, but can never be about racial balancing. Swapping precincts in and out of Districts to make them whiter or blacker is unconstitutional; *and*

WHEREAS, Sunday, October 9, 2022, Dianne Wilkerson sends an email to seven City Councilors, and others, with the subject line: *CITY OF BOSTON REDISTRICTING/IMPORTANT MEETING OCTOBER 10, 2022.* In this email she states that the redistricting process is finally underway and needs to “*SOUND THE ALARM*”. She also writes: “*I AM HAPPY TO REPORT THAT WE ALREADY HAVE THE MAJOR SUPPORT OF THE CITY COUNCIL MEMBERS*”*and;*

WHEREAS, On Wednesday, October 19th Dianne sent a reply email to Wayne Yeh after he shared council meeting documents with her. She replies that she is concerned that the map is still being worked on and that “*CUTTING TO 3 IS IMPORTANT.*”; ***NOW, THEREFORE BE IT***

ORDERED: That the appropriate committee of the Boston City Council hold a hearing to discuss these concerns and ensure that we, the Boston City Council Committee of Redistricting, followed the proper procedures to redraw the redistricting maps.

Filed on: April 5, 2023

On Wed, Sep 28, 2022, 12:44 PM QUEEN CARRIE <carriemays101@gmail.com> wrote:
Great meeting yesterday! Can we get the toolkit for Councilor's Tania and Arroyo's map?

On Wed, Sep 28, 2022 at 12:37 PM Greater Mattapan Neighborhood Council <info.gmncouncil@gmail.com> wrote:
Hello,

Here is a link to the map that was shown last night by Councilors Liz Breadon & Broan Worrell. I found this link within the "toolkit" they sent out.

<https://boston.maps.arcgis.com/apps/webappviewer/index.html?id=4af2c3a537ca480d80fdb899287e1070>

Thanks,
Fatima

On Tue, Sep 27, 2022 at 10:25 PM Victoria Williams <vkwilliams@gmail.com> wrote:

Great job Team!

I think it would be helpful to have a list of the current wards and precincts currently in each district and a listing of those that will move and to where for each of the different versions of the maps.

Also to know if any precincts are being split.

Best, Victoria

Sent from my iPad

> On Sep 26, 2022, at 2:56 PM, Dianne Wilkerson <newday.dw52@gmail.com> wrote:

>

>

>

>

> Good afternoon Folks

>

> Much has happened since we talked initially on Friday. The Boston City Council has scheduled several Working Sessions for this week, including this afternoon. It appears as of this communication, today's meeting is not going to be live streamed. Our focus is to be able to participate in the Boston City Council Redistricting Hearing scheduled for Thursday, September 29 at 3 pm at Boston City Hall. In order to prepare, and be informed, we've scheduled and we're inviting you to a meeting on tomorrow, Tuesday, September 27, 6:00 PM-8:00 PM at Lena Park Community Development Corp. , [150 American Legion Highway, Dorchester](#). Plenty of free parking available.

>

> It is important that you attend because we MUST avoid being pitted. We know that there have been conversations with Haitian and Cape Verdean Boston residents but it's not clear what level of information, background they were provided. This is a major issue for all of Black/Latino Boston to make sure our power is fortified and not diluted. See you tomorrow.

>

> President Sullivan has invited the 6 City Councilors who represent Roxbury, Dorchester, Mattapan, Hyde Park as well as the Redistricting Committee Co-Chairs. They will be given a slotted time to present on both the guiding principles and their thoughts on what the map should look like. You should know that there are at least 3 maps circulating now. We'll hear the thinking from the sponsoring Councilors and get to ask questions. We're anticipating a total of about forty attendees. Our focus is to invite those thought leaders who have experience and/or interest in how these lines get drawn. We need you to attend. Please let me know if there are others who should be invited as well.

>

> Please let us know if you can attend and others you believe should be invited.

>

> Blessings

>

> Dianne Wilkerson

>

From: Wayne Yeh <wayne.yeh@boston.gov>
Sent: Friday, October 07, 2022 3:20 PM EDT
To: Moran, Michael - Rep. (HOU) <michael.moran@mahouse.gov>; brian.rielly@mahouse.gov <brian.rielly@mahouse.gov>; Burns, Nakeeda (HOU) <nakeeda.burns@mahouse.gov>
CC: Elizabeth Breadon <liz.breadon@boston.gov>

Subject: Boston Redistricting

Attachment(s): "Redistricting Proposal Docket #1186 (Arroyo, Fernandes Anderson).pdf", "Redistricting Proposal Docket #1215 (Murphy).pdf", "Redistricting Proposal Docket #1216 (Breadon, Worrell).pdf", "Data_Current_Districts_2010-2020.pdf", "Data_Baseline_Districts_2010-2020.pdf", "Redistricting Committee Proposal (Docket #1216) 10-03-2022.pdf"

Hello Rep. Moran, Brian, and Nakeeda, this is Wayne from Councilor Breadon's office.

Liz asked me to send over the materials for our currently proposed redistricting maps to see if you could run some analysis and let us know your thoughts. We've gotten materials uploaded to the Committee website at boston.gov/redistricting.

Our top objective was to create a 4th minority-opportunity district of at least 60% by Voting Age Population, which we achieved in District 3 through a 3.1% bump by shifting 8 precincts on the border of Districts 3 and 4. District 4 is already over 90% minority. I found that this could also be achieved with just moving 7 precincts, but we decided to go bold and are receiving fierce opposition as expected, in addition to some misinformation as to VRA requirements. We'd be happy to hear your thoughts on the proposals or to connect on redistricting at any time.

Here are the various maps with slides attached:

- Baseline current districts (reconciling split precincts) - [Shapefile](#)
- Docket #1186 (Arroyo, Fernandes Anderson) - [Shapefile](#), [Map PDF](#)
- Docket #1215 (Murphy) - [Shapefile](#), [Map PDF](#)
- Docket #1216 (Breadon, Worrell) - [Shapefile](#), [Map PDF](#)

We also have some interactive maps:

- [Baseline districts](#)
- [Current actual districts](#)
- [State and congressional districts overlaid](#)
- [Proposed maps](#)

We had to push to even get good data from the City. Here is what we got:

- Precincts: <https://bpda.box.com/s/ghdbnwopnux01r7a9rjnxuntyxdfvog>
- Current Council Districts: <https://bpda.box.com/s/6zed8gbk95nkuwoj2c5qz9ezlp4qq7rk>
- Revised Baseline Districts: <https://bpda.box.com/s/oqedyk1xr278bl84zlfjgvwo7rp32p8>

Also sharing some of the data I put together:

[Comparison of Proposed Redistricting Plans](#)

Wayne
cell: 530-518-7542

--



Wayne Yeh 葉威 (he, him, his)

Policy Director

Office of Boston City Councilor Liz Breadon, District

9

(617) 635-3113 | Wayne.Yeh@boston.gov

This email is subject to [M.G.L. Ch. 66, §10 Public Records Law](#).

From: Dianne Wilkerson <newday.dw52@gmail.com>

Sent: Friday, October 07, 2022 10:24 PM EDT

To: Wayne Yeh <wayne.yeh@boston.gov>

Subject: Re: Community Meetings on Redistricting

Great, talk to you then. Will send you a link right before.
dw

On Fri, Oct 7, 2022 at 10:17 PM Wayne Yeh <wayne.yeh@boston.gov> wrote:

Hello Senator Wilkerson, yes I can be available tomorrow at 9am.

On Fri, Oct 7, 2022 at 10:06 PM Dianne Wilkerson <newday.dw52@gmail.com> wrote:

Hello Wayne;

We want to make sure that Chair Breadon has an opportunity to review the unity map before we release it publicly over the holiday weekend. Tanisha Sullivan and I would like to speak to you first. Are you available to connect in the morning @ 9am. We need to walk you through it on the particular issues we know are of importance to us all. Let me know and we'll send you a link.

Blessings

Dianne Wilkerson

On Wed, Oct 5, 2022 at 4:38 PM Wayne Yeh <wayne.yeh@boston.gov> wrote:

Hello Senator Wilkerson,

I am encouraging the Council President's office to allow us to accommodate two community meetings with one held at the Bolling Building. I think that would absolutely be our preferred option, however the date would likely not be for within the next week.

I will work on getting a clearer answer by the end of the day tomorrow and let you know of any progress.

Very best,
Wayne

On Wed, Oct 5, 2022 at 1:23 PM Dianne Wilkerson <newday.dw52@gmail.com> wrote:

Wayne

I sent this via text to Chair Breadon. Wanted to make sure you got a copy also. Would appreciate your assistance getting an answer today.

Thx
DW

"Good afternoon Councilor. Just checking to see whether you've scheduled a meeting for Tuesday at Bolling Bldg.? We need to start getting notice out. If not, we will schedule a community meeting. One way or another we need to be meeting with community by next week.
Let me know.

Thx
Dianne Wilkerson "



Wayne Yeh 葉威 (he, him, his)

Policy Director

Office of Boston City Councilor Liz Breadon, District
9

(617) 635-3113 | Wayne.Yeh@boston.gov

This email is subject to [M.G.L. Ch. 66, §10 Public Records Law](#).

From: Wayne Yeh <wayne.yeh@boston.gov>
Sent: Monday, October 10, 2022 12:00 AM EDT
To: Wayne Yeh <wayne.d.yeh@gmail.com>
Subject: Fwd: CITY OF BOSTON REDISTRICTING/ IMPORTANT MEETING oCTOBER 10, 2022
Attachment(s): "Canva Design (3).png"

----- Forwarded message -----

From: Dianne Wilkerson <newday.dw52@gmail.com>
Date: Sun, Oct 9, 2022 at 11:58 PM
Subject: CITY OF BOSTON REDISTRICTING/ IMPORTANT MEETING oCTOBER 10, 2022
To: Ruthzee Louijeune <Ruthzee.louijeune@boston.gov>, <kendra.lara@boston.gov>, Ricardo Arroyo <Ricardo.Arroyo@boston.gov>, Tania Anderson <Tania.Anderson@boston.gov>, Brian Worrell <brian.worrell@boston.gov>, Julia Mejia <julia.mejia@boston.gov>, Elizabeth Breadon <liz.breadon@boston.gov>
CC: William E Dickerson II <ewilliamdickerson@gmail.com>, Victoria Williams <kkmwilliams@gmail.com>, William F. Watkins <wwatkins@ulem.org>, <carriemays101@gmail.com>, The New Democracy Coalition of Massachusetts <thenewdemocracycoalition@gmail.com>, Holmes, Russell -Rep (HOU) <Russell.Holmes@mahouse.gov>, Willie Bodrick, II <williewill.bodrick@gmail.com>, <vsnow@massvote.org>, Cornell <cornell.mills@gmail.com>, darryl smith <darryl.smith@hotmail.com>, Wayne Yeh <wayne.yeh@boston.gov>

Good afternoon all:

As you may already know, the City of Boston is in the process of redrawing the lines for our 9 city council districts. The redistricting must be done by November 7, 2022, so things are moving fast! A number of community organizations have been following this most important process and we are sounding the alert for your attention. If you had an opportunity to watch the council working session this past Friday (see below) then you know that this process has major implications for Roxbury and Dorchester in particular and the city as a whole.

Folks, we cannot underscore and stress the importance of these next 3 weeks. Any doubt will be erased if you review Friday's session. In particular, Councilor Baker lays out his position starting at @ 57 minutes. The good news is that we've been listening very intently to all the public testimony, reviewed the principles of the Voting Rights Act, reviewed the 2020 Census for Boston, reviewed the maps released by both Arroyo/Fernandes Anderson and Chair Breadon/ Worrell and, led by NAACP Boston Branch, taken the best of both to create a unity map to be submitted by our coalition of organizations. This process and this map have MAJOR implications for South End, South Boston, Roxbury, Dorchester, and Mattapan! We will be briefing the community on the map tomorrow, Monday, October 10, 2022, from 6:30 PM-8:00 PM. Please attend. We understand that this is short notice but the City Council Redistricting Committee just announced Friday afternoon that it will be holding a hearing on Tuesday 10/11 to discuss the maps they have submitted. You need to see our map. We're happy to report that we already have the major support of City Council members, and Black, Latino, and Asian leaders from the neighborhoods to be greatly impacted by this process. 's happening fast but we need to meet, to allow our community to view the map, and update you on what's happening before Tuesday's City Hall hearing. The Redistricting Committee Chair, Councilor Liz Breadon, will be joining us at tomorrow's meeting. Please attend.

Thanks

Dianne Wilkerson

<https://youtu.be/bcHqzUfkAYE>

--



Wayne Yeh 葉威 (he, him, his)

Policy Director

Office of Boston City Councilor Liz Breadon, District 9

(617) 635-3113 | Wayne.Yeh@boston.gov

This email is subject to [M.G.L. Ch. 66, §10 Public Records Law](#).

From: Dianne Wilkerson <newday.dw52@gmail.com>
Sent: Monday, October 17, 2022 11:14 PM EDT
To: Wayne Yeh <wayne.yeh@boston.gov>
CC: Tanisha Sullivan <naacpbostonpresident@gmail.com>
Subject: Re: Proposed Redistricting Plan Councilors Breadon and Arroyo (Docket #1275)

Wayne

Thanks for the prompt response. I agree with you and appreciate the background. As I'm sure you did as well, I listened intently to FB go on and on about coalitions today. About the coalitions other councilors had to amass to win, the coalition he'd created in D3. So I just want us to be careful not to embrace his language lest we confuse folks. There are so many things about today's session that concerned me. Hope we can discuss it soon.

Thanks to Chair Breadon again for her extraordinary show of patience and grace today. If this is what we see publicly I can only imagine the comments and conversations we don't see. Hats off to her. We continue to stand with her.
Blessings

Dianne Wilkerson

On Mon, Oct 17, 2022 at 10:55 PM Wayne Yeh <wayne.yeh@boston.gov> wrote:

Thank you Senator for raising this point and the need for clarity.

I have previously seen "coalition" used interchangeably or together with "opportunity" in redistricting for districts where a single racial group does not make up a majority or clear plurality of the population, but where the minority population in whole (non-White non-Hispanic races, plus Hispanic ethnicity) has a reasonable opportunity to elect the candidate of their choice. Here is an example on the 5th line of page 429: <https://harvardcrcl.org/wp-content/uploads/sites/10/2015/11/Two-Fs-for-Formalism.pdf#page=27>

Some clarification between the use of "coalition districts" and "opportunity districts" here might be helpful to us: <https://redistricting.ils.edu/wp-content/uploads/Basics-English10.pdf>

I think that Councilor Baker was referring to District 3 "already" being an opportunity district simply by reaching over 50% minority population by race, rather than any other guidepost of 60-70%, for example. The intent is to distinguish the difference between the legacy, strongly held Black seats and the districts drawn in such a way to bolster the opportunities. I agree that the language we use is important, and will be sure to be more intentional about the terms that we use.

On Mon, Oct 17, 2022 at 10:33 PM Dianne Wilkerson <newday.dw52@gmail.com> wrote:

Wayne;

Thanks for the copy. After watching today's Working Session, I feel the need to reiterate my oft-stated caution that we be careful with the language we use. I'm not sure where the notion came from but I see the label 'coalition opportunity district' used on your map to describe D3 and D5. I would remind you that Councilor Baker used that to describe his map. Coalition opportunity map is not a thing. I really would urge you to rethink the use of that term. And what exactly does it mean? It's just not a thing.
DW

On Mon, Oct 17, 2022 at 10:25 PM Wayne Yeh <wayne.yeh@boston.gov> wrote:

From: Dianne Wilkerson <newday.dw52@gmail.com>
Sent: Wednesday, October 19, 2022 4:04 PM EDT
To: Wayne Yeh <wayne.yeh@boston.gov>
CC: Tanisha Sullivan <naacpbostonpresident@gmail.com>
Subject: Re: Redistricting Principles Committee Report

Thanks Wayne. I am concerned that the Breadon and Arroyo maps are still on the table. What's the plan? Cutting to 3 is important. Is there still a plan of withdrawing them?
D

On Wed, Oct 19, 2022, 12:16 PM Wayne Yeh <wayne.yeh@boston.gov> wrote:

Here is the Committee report on the redistricting principles docket that Chair Breadon is submitting today.

--



Wayne Yeh 葉威 (he, him, his)

Policy Director

Office of Boston City Councilor Liz Breadon, District

9

(617) 635-3113 • Wayne.Yeh@boston.gov

This email is subject to [M.G.L. Ch. 66, §10 Public Records Law](#).